

**STATUS:**

**A5414-A** Englebright (MS) Same as [S 1823-A](#) MORAHAN

Labor Law

TITLE....Establishes a civil cause of action for employees who are subjected to an abusive work environment

02/13/09 referred to labor

05/06/09 amend and recommit to labor

05/06/09 print number 5414a

**SUMMARY:**

ENGLEBRIGHT, COLTON, GUNTHER, MILLMAN, LAVINE, JAFFEE, SCHROEDER, GABRYSZAK, BARRA, SCHIMEL, STIRPE, KELLNER, ROSENTHAL, BOYLAND; M-S: Cusick, Galef, Hooper, Latimer, McDonough, McEneny, O'Donnell, Perry, Saladino, Thiele, Walker  
Add Art 20-D SS760 - 769, Lab L  
Establishes a civil cause of action for employees who are subjected to an abusive work environment.

**BILL TEXT:**

## STATE OF NEW YORK

5414--A

2009-2010 Regular Sessions

### IN ASSEMBLY

February 13, 2009

Introduced by M. of A. ENGLEBRIGHT, COLTON, GUNTHER, MILLMAN, LAVINE, JAFFEE, SCHROEDER, GABRYSZAK, BARRA, SCHIMEL, STIRPE, KELLNER, ROSENTHAL, BOYLAND -- Multi-Sponsored by -- M. of A. HOOPER, LATIMER, McDONOUGH, McENENY, O'DONNELL, PERRY, SALADINO, THIELE, WALKER -- read once and referred to the Committee on Labor -- committee discharged, bill amended, ordered reprinted as amended and recommitted to said committee

AN ACT to amend the labor law, in relation to establishing a private cause of action for an abusive work environment

The People of the State of New York, represented in Senate and Assembly, do enact as follows:

1 Section 1. The labor law is amended by adding a new article 20-D to  
2 read as follows:

ARTICLE 20-D

ABUSIVE WORK ENVIRONMENT

5 Section 760. Legislative findings and intent.

6 761. Definitions.

7 762. Abusive work environment.

8 763. Employer liability.

9 764. Defenses.

10           765. Retaliation.  
11           766. Remedies.  
12           767. Enforcement.  
13           768. Effect on collective bargaining agreements.  
14           769. Effect of other laws.  
15       § 760. Legislative findings and intent. The legislature hereby finds  
16 that the social and economic well-being of the state is dependent upon  
17 healthy and productive employees. Surveys and studies have documented  
18 that between sixteen and twenty-one percent of employees directly expe-  
19 rience health endangering workplace bullying, abuse and harassment.  
20 Such behavior is four times more prevalent than sexual harassment. These

EXPLANATION--Matter in italics (underscored) is new; matter in brackets  
[-] is old law to be omitted.

LBD00743-03-9

A. 5414--A

2

1 surveys and studies have further found that abusive work environments  
2 can have serious effects on the targeted employees, including feelings  
3 of shame and humiliation, stress, loss of sleep, severe anxiety,  
4 depression, post-traumatic stress disorder, reduced immunity to  
5 infection, stress-related gastrointestinal disorders, hypertension, and  
6 pathophysiologic changes that increase the risk of cardiovascular  
7 diseases.

8 Furthermore, the legislature finds that abusive work environments can  
9 have serious consequences for employers, including reduced employee  
10 productivity and morale, higher turnover and absenteeism rates, and  
11 significant increases in medical and workers' compensation claims.

12 The legislature hereby finds that unless mistreated employees have  
13 been subjected to abusive treatment in the workplace on the basis of  
14 race, color, sex, national origin or age, such employees are unlikely to  
15 have legal recourse to redress such treatment.

16 The legislature hereby declares that legal protection from abusive  
17 work environments should not be limited to behavior grounded in a  
18 protected class status as required by employment discrimination stat-  
19 utes. Existing workers' compensation provisions and common law tort law  
20 are inadequate to discourage such abusive conduct and provide adequate  
21 redress to employees who have been harmed by abusive work environments.

22 The purpose of this article shall be to provide legal redress for  
23 employees who have been harmed psychologically, physically or econom-  
24 ically by being deliberately subjected to abusive work environments; and  
25 to provide legal incentives for employers to prevent and respond to  
26 mistreatment of employees at work.

27 § 761. Definitions. As used in this article, the following terms shall  
28 have the following meanings:

29 1. "Abusive conduct" means conduct, with malice, taken against an  
30 employee by an employer or another employee in the workplace, that a  
31 reasonable person would find to be hostile, offensive and unrelated to  
32 the employer's legitimate business interests. In considering whether  
33 such conduct is occurring, the trier of fact should weigh the severity,  
34 nature and frequency of the conduct. Abusive conduct shall include, but  
35 not be limited to, repeated infliction of verbal abuse, such as the use  
36 of derogatory remarks, insults and epithets; verbal or physical conduct  
37 that a reasonable person would find threatening, intimidating or humili-  
38 ating; or the gratuitous sabotage or undermining of an employee's work  
39 performance. A single act shall not constitute abusive conduct, unless  
40 the trier of fact finds such act to be especially severe or egregious.

41 2. "Abusive work environment" means a workplace in which an employee  
42 is subjected to abusive conduct that is so severe that it causes phys-  
43 ical or psychological harm to such employee.

44 3. "Conduct" means all forms of behavior, including acts and omissions  
45 to act.

46 4. "Constructive discharge" means abusive conduct against an employee  
47 that causes such employee to resign from his or her employment where (a)  
48 prior to resigning, the employee provides notice to the employer that an  
49 abusive work environment exists, and (b) the employer, after receiving  
50 notice thereof, fails to eliminate the abusive conduct.

51 5. "Malice" means the intent to cause another person to suffer psycho-  
52 logical, physical or economic harm, without legitimate cause or justi-  
53 fication. Malice may be inferred from the presence of factors such as  
54 outward expressions of hostility, harmful conduct inconsistent with an  
55 employer's legitimate business interests, a continuation of harmful and  
56 illegitimate conduct after a complainant requests that it cease or

A. 5414--A

3

1 displays outward signs of emotional or physical distress in the face of  
2 the conduct, or attempts to exploit the complainant's known psycholog-  
3 ical or physical vulnerability.

4 6. "Negative employment decision" means a termination, constructive  
5 discharge, demotion, unfavorable reassignment, refusal to promote or  
6 disciplinary action.

7 7. "Physical harm" means the material impairment of a person's phys-  
8 ical health or bodily integrity, as documented by a competent physician  
9 or supported by competent expert evidence at trial.

10 8. "Psychological harm" means the material impairment of a person's  
11 mental health, as documented by a competent physician or supported by  
12 competent expert evidence at trial.

13 § 762. Abusive work environment. It shall be unlawful to subject an  
14 employee to an abusive work environment.

15 § 763. Employer liability. An employer shall be civilly liable for the  
16 existence of an abusive work environment within any workplace under its  
17 control.

18 § 764. Defenses. 1. It shall be an affirmative defense to a cause of  
19 action for abusive work environment, that the employer exercised reason-  
20 able care to prevent and promptly correct the abusive conduct which is  
21 the basis of such cause of action and the plaintiff unreasonably failed  
22 to take advantage of the appropriate preventive or corrective opportu-  
23 nities provided by such employer. Such affirmative defense shall not be  
24 available to an employer when the abusive conduct culminates in a nega-  
25 tive employment decision with regard to the plaintiff.

26 2. It shall be an affirmative defense to a cause of action for abusive  
27 work environment, that the employer made a negative employment decision  
28 with regard to the plaintiff which is consistent with such employer's  
29 legitimate business interests, such as termination or demotion based on  
30 the plaintiff's poor performance or the complaint is based primarily  
31 upon the employer's reasonable investigation of potentially dangerous,  
32 illegal or unethical activity.

33 § 765. Retaliation. Any retaliatory action against any employee alleg-  
34 ing a violation of this article shall be deemed to be a retaliatory  
35 personnel action as prohibited by section seven hundred forty of this  
36 chapter.

37 § 766. Remedies. 1. Where a defendant has been found to have engaged  
38 in abusive conduct, or caused or maintained an abusive work environment,  
39 the court may enjoin such defendant from engaging in such illegal activ-  
40 ity and may order any other relief that is appropriate including, but  
41 not limited to, reinstatement, removal of the offending party from the  
42 plaintiff's work environment, reimbursement for lost wages, medical  
43 expenses, compensation for emotional distress, punitive damages and  
44 attorney fees.

45 2. Where an employer has been found to have caused or maintained an  
46 abusive work environment that did not result in a negative employment  
47 decision, such employer's liability for damages for emotional distress  
48 shall not exceed twenty-five thousand dollars and shall have no liabil-  
49 ity for punitive damages. The provisions of this subdivision shall not  
50 apply to any employee who engages in abusive conduct.

51 § 767. Enforcement. 1. The provisions of this article are enforceable  
52 by means of a civil cause of action commenced by an injured employee.

53 2. Notwithstanding the provisions of the civil practice law and rules,  
54 an action to enforce the provisions of this article shall be commenced  
55 within one year of the last abusive conduct which is the basis of the  
56 allegation of abusive work environment.

A. 5414--A

4

1     § 768. Effect on collective bargaining agreements. This article shall  
 2 not prevent, interfere, exempt or supersede any current provisions of an  
 3 employee's existing collective bargaining agreement which provides  
 4 greater rights and protections than prescribed in this article nor shall  
 5 this article prevent any new provisions of the collective bargaining  
 6 agreement which provide greater rights and protections from being imple-  
 7 mented and applicable to such employee within such collective bargaining  
 8 agreement. Where the collective bargaining agreement provides greater  
 9 rights and protections than prescribed in this article, the recognized  
 10 collective bargaining agent may opt to accept or reject to be covered by  
 11 the provisions of this article.

12     § 769. Effect of other laws. 1. No provision of this article shall be  
 13 deemed to exempt any person or entity from any liability, duty or penal-  
 14 ty provided by any other state law, rule or regulation.

15     2. The remedies of this article shall be granted in addition to any  
 16 compensation available pursuant to the workers' compensation law;  
 17 provided, however, that no person who has collected workers' compen-  
 18 sation benefits for conditions arising out of an abusive work environ-  
 19 ment, shall be authorized to commence a cause of action pursuant to this  
 20 article for the same such conditions.

21     § 2. This act shall take effect immediately, and shall apply to  
 22 abusive conduct occurring on or after such date.

**SPONSORS MEMO:**

**NEW YORK STATE ASSEMBLY  
 MEMORANDUM IN SUPPORT OF LEGISLATION  
 submitted in accordance with Assembly Rule III, Sec 1(e)**

**BILL NUMBER:** A5414A

**SPONSOR:** Englebright (MS)

**TITLE OF BILL:** An act to amend the labor law, in relation to estab-  
 lishing a private cause of action for an abusive work environment

**PURPOSE OR GENERAL IDEA OF THE BILL:** to establish a civil cause of  
 action for employees who are subject to an abusive work environment

**SUMMARY OF PROVISIONS:** Clearly states the definitions of abusive  
 conduct; abusive work environment; conduct; constructive discharge;  
 employee; employer; malice; negative employment decision; physical harm;  
 and psychological harm.

Section 3 defines Unlawful Employment Practice Section 4 defines Employ-  
 er Liability

Section 5 defines Defenses

Section 6 defines Retaliation

Section 7 defines Relief  
 Relief generally

Employer liability

Section 8 defines Procedures

Private right of action

Time limitations

Section 9 defines Effect on other state laws

Other state laws

Worker's compensation and election remedies

**JUSTIFICATION:** The social and economic well-being of the state is dependent upon healthy and productive employees. Surveys and studies have documented that between 16 to 21 percent of employees directly experience health-endangering workplace bullying, abuse and harassment, and that this behavior is four times more prevalent than sexual harassment alone. Surveys and studies have also documented that abusive work environments can have serious effects on targeted employees, including feelings of shame and humiliation, stress, loss of sleep, severe anxiety, depression, post-traumatic stress disorder, reduced immunity to infection, stress related gastrointestinal disorders, hypertension, pathophysiologic changes that increase the risk of cardiovascular disease and other such effects.

This legislation will provide legal redress for employees who have been harmed, psychologically, physically, or economically. It will also provide legal incentives for employers to prevent and respond to mistreatment of employees at work.

**LEGISLATIVE HISTORY:** 2007-08 A10291 referred to labor

**FISCAL IMPLICATIONS:** None,

**EFFECTIVE DATE:** This act shall take effect immediately.

---